

4.10 CULTURAL RESOURCES

Introduction

This section of the Draft EIR focuses on the project's potential impacts to cultural, historic, and archaeological resources. An Area of Potential Effect (APE) was prepared as part of environmental review for the Broadway Brommer project in 1999 (City of Santa Cruz, 1999) and approved by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) in 1999. A Historic Property Survey Report/Finding of Effect (HPSR) was also prepared for the project and approved by SHPO in 1997 (Basin Research Associates, 1997). In October 2004, a preliminary historical research report for the updated Master Plan was also prepared (Lehmann, 2004). These sources were used in preparing this section of the EIR.

Environmental Setting

Archaeological Resources. In this portion of Santa Cruz County, Native American archaeological sites are found on valley terraces that are adjacent to Monterey Bay and along seasonal and perennial watercourses. The Master Plan area includes portions of valley terrace formation near the Upper Harbor. Prehistoric resources that could potentially exist on the valley terraces include chert or obsidian flakes, projectile points, mortars and pestles, dark friable soils containing shell and bone dietary debris, heat-affected rock, or human burials.

Archival research and field investigations did not identify any prehistoric or historic archaeological sites within the Master Plan area. No surface indicators of either prehistoric or historic cultural materials were observed during the archaeological inventory. Archival research suggests minimal potential for significant subsurface prehistoric or historic archaeological materials within the project site (City of Santa Cruz, 1999).

Site History. Arana Gulch was originally part of the 92-acre Rancho Portrero y Rincon de SanPedro Regaldo which was initially granted to Jose Ramon Buelna in 1838. The claim was rejected and the Rancho was regranted in 1842 to Jose Arana in 1842 by Governor Juan Batista Alvarado. Arana, who settled in the area in the gulch that bears his name, died in 1868.

In 1878, the property, now known as Live Oak Ranch, became the retirement home of Frederick Hagemann, a native of Hanover, Germany, who came to California in 1853. Hagemann tried unsuccessfully to make his fortune in the gold fields but, like many entrepreneurs, found prosperity by becoming a merchant. Following years as the owner of the Albany Brewery, he retired to Live Oak Ranch where he raised wheat as well as cattle, horses, hogs, and poultry.

In the 1920s, the property was owned by the Kinzli brothers (Hans and Ernest) and was the site of the East Side Dairy. The dairy continued to operate from the 1940s through the mid-1950s under the ownership of Carl Detlin and Joseph Sigris. The property continued to be grazed until the late 1980s.

In September 1994, the City of Santa Cruz purchased 63 acres of the Arana Gulch property. This purchase did not include the adjoining Hagemann ranch house, which was enlarged and remodeled in the 1880s. The house and grounds were listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1975 and are presently used as a private residence (Lehmann, 2004) (see discussion below regarding Live Oak Ranch).

Nearby Architectural Resources. Architectural resources in the vicinity of the project span the years from the 1860s to the present day. The properties within the general vicinity of the project site belong to three groups: (1) 19th century properties (1860s - 1880s), (2) early 20th century properties (1900 - 1940s), and (3) post-1950 properties.

In the first group is a single property, the Live Oak Ranch (also known as Hagemann Ranch), consisting of seven buildings and associated landscaping on 7.3 acres. This property is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The Live Oak Ranch is a rare surviving example in Santa Cruz County of a ranch complex dating from the 1800s. The main house, enlarged and remodeled by Frederick Hagemann in the 1880s, is an outstanding example of Eastlake Style design.

In the second group are a number of properties built between 1900 and the 1940s along Frederick Street and 7th Avenue on either side of the Master Plan site. Most of these properties were built as single-family houses, with a garage, barn or other outbuildings in the rear. They represent a later period of development than the Live Oak Ranch.

In the third group are a number of houses and apartment buildings that were built primarily in the late 1950s to 1970s. These are all less than 50 years old and are not historically significant.

A *Historic Property Survey Report* (HPSR) was prepared for the project site when the earlier bike path was proposed and was submitted to the State Office of Historic Preservation (SHPO) on March 19, 1997. The HPSR reviewed six separate potentially significant properties. Only one property, Live Oak Ranch (Hagemann Ranch), which has already been listed on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP), was eligible for inclusion on the NRHP.

Impacts and Mitigation Measures

Significance Criteria. The proposed project would have a significant effect on cultural or historic resources if it would:

- Significantly alter a significant historical resource, either directly or indirectly, such as disturbing views to or from the property.
- Disturb subsurface prehistoric or historic archaeological materials.

Less-Than-Significant Impacts. The Canyon Trail would pass adjacent to the southern boundary shown for the Live Oak Ranch in the National Register of Historic Places. An existing row of Monterey Cypress trees on the Live Oak Ranch currently obscures views to and from the existing trail, which is also in the future location of the paved multi-use Canyon Trail. Thus, no significant impacts to this adjacent historic resource are anticipated.

Potentially Significant Impacts. The project would have the following potentially significant impacts.

Impact CULT-1: Construction of the Master Plan elements (paved pathways, retaining walls and bridge) could result in the disturbance of previously undiscovered historic or prehistoric cultural resources, deposits, or artifacts. (PS)

Archival research suggests a minimal potential for significant subsurface prehistoric or historic archaeological materials on the site. While no recorded archaeological resources have been identified at the project site, a small potential exists for the uncovering of such resources during on-site construction and grading activities.

Mitigation Measure CULT-1: If any indicators of the presence of cultural resources are discovered during the construction of the project, earth-disturbing work shall be halted in an area within a radius of 10 meters (33 feet) around the suspected deposits, and an archaeologist or cultural resource specialist shall be consulted in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. If deemed appropriate under CEQA, data and artifact recovery shall be conducted during the period when construction work is halted. (LTS)

Impact CULT-2: Construction of the proposed project could disturb previously-unknown human burial sites of Native American groups, a potentially significant impact. (PS)

Mitigation Measure CULT-2: If human remains are discovered during the construction of the project elements, an appropriate representative of Native American groups and the County Coroner shall be informed and consulted, as required by law. Mitigation Measure CULT-1 shall also apply in such a situation. (LTS)

Cumulative Impacts. The proposed project, in combination with other proposed nearby projects, would not result in cumulative impacts to cultural resources.

References

- Basin Research Associates, 1997. *Historic Properties Survey Report/Finding of Effect, Broadway-Brommer Bike Path.*
- City of Santa Cruz, 1999. *Broadway-Brommer Street Bicycle/Path Connection Draft Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Assessment (EIR/EA)*, November.
- City of Santa Cruz, 1992. *City of Santa Cruz General Plan and Local Coastal Program (1990-2005)*. Amended 1994.
- Lehmann, Susan, Historical Resources Consultant, 2004. *Arana Gulch Preliminary Historical Research*. Prepared for City of Santa Cruz Parks and Recreation Department, October 14.

